

CSUCI  
Critical Learning  
Collectives 2022-23

# CLCs with President Yao and Cabinet Discussion #3

April 13, 2023

## AGENDA 3

1. Group Norms/Agreements (5 minutes)
2. Review 4/06/2023 survey results: Top 10 recommendations by four timelines of impact
3. Which of the various “Top-10” recommendations should be included in the Strategic Directions & Initiatives Framework? Which clearly help answer the “how?” for Strategic Directions?
  - a. Is it actionable?
  - b. Will the action, if implemented as written, result in the desired outcome? (e.g., 2b)
  - c. Does explicit or implied responsibility for success point outward, inward, or both?
4. At your table or with 1-2 partners: “CLC Recommendations–From Top 10 to Top Few” survey
5. Next steps: President Yao and Cabinet
  - a. Review campus Qualtrics survey feedback (due April 19)
  - b. Add selected CLC recommendations to Strategic Directions & Initiatives Framework
  - c. Engage campus in finalizing SD&I Framework and in defining objectives, metrics, and timelines for each initiative



## Agreements for Discussion

### Why?

We must abandon completely the naive faith that school automatically liberates the mind and serves the cause of human progress; in fact, we know that it may serve any cause.

[Education] may serve tyranny as well as truth, war as well as peace, death as well as life. . . Whether it is good or evil depends, not on the laws of learning, but on the conception of life and civilization that gives it substance and direction. In the course of history, education has served every purpose and doctrine contrived by [human beings]. *If it is to serve the cause of human freedom, it must be explicitly designed for that purpose.* (George Counts, cited in Giroux and Freire, 2004, p. 9, emphasis added)

## **CAMPUS CLIMATE DISCUSSION**

**Staff, Faculty, and Administrative CLC Participants with  
Executive Leadership**

What are we going through?

What do we hope for?

How can we get there?

What are the roadblocks?

What can we commit to?

## 10 TOPICS EMERGED

from September 2022 - March 2023

50 employee participants in six, year-long CLCs

1

Accountability

2

Career Advancement

3

Communication

4

Community

5

DEIA

6

Organizational  
Effectiveness

7

Professional Growth

8

Transitions

9

Trust

10

Work Equity





01

## ACCOUNTABILITY

HOW ARE DECISIONS MADE?

HOW ARE ADMINISTRATORS EVALUATED?



## ACCOUNTABILITY: TOPICS & SUGGESTIONS

Topics of Discussion	Suggested Actions
Decision-making, checks and balances	Implement a system for vetting decisions before implementing them. Ensure stakeholder feedback at every stage of decision making -- rework the decision, the policy, etc., -- member-checking built into decisions.
Staff needs and wants, supervisor evaluations	Revise MP performance evaluation form to reflect feedback from CLC discussions (e.g., 360 evaluations; supervisors evaluated by staff as well as by their supervisor)



02

## **CAREER ADVANCEMENT**

HOW MUST WE ADDRESS “MOVE OUT TO MOVE UP”?  
HOW CAN WE ENSURE CLARITY AND OPPORTUNITY FOR  
STAFF ADVANCEMENT OPPORTUNITIES?



## CAREER ADVANCEMENT: TOPICS & SUGGESTIONS

Topics of Discussion	Suggested Actions
Professional development	Connect professional development with career progression
Lack of staff knowledge of established advancement processes	Staff awareness of options and opportunities for advancement (IRPs, In-class, Re-class).
Lack of advancement and career progression opportunities and structure for staff	Structured and clear opportunities for advancement, and not just for certain groups.





03

## COMMUNICATION

HOW CAN WE ADDRESS NEEDS FOR BETTER CLARITY?  
WHAT CAN WE DO TO ENSURE MORE EFFECTIVE  
ONBOARDING FOR NEW EMPLOYEES?

# COMMUNICATION: TOPICS & SUGGESTIONS

Topics of Discussion	Suggested Actions
Presentation of quantitative data	For campus-wide data analysis & decision-making processes, entities collecting and reporting should present the quantitative data in a way that is usable by a wide audience.
Lack of "closing-the-loop" communications lead to "nothing happens" impressions	Ensure "closing-the-loop" communications on major initiatives
Need for capturing institutional history/memory	Create and implement a system for institutional memory on this campus—for initiatives, definitions, historical context, overlap, and continuity.
Onboarding experiences not always welcoming, purposeful, and/or helpful	<p>We propose more purposeful onboarding processes for all new (or new to their position) staff, faculty and administration to increase staff connection and morale. This year's onboarding for new tenure track faculty was a step in the right direction.</p> <p>Unions should be a prominent part of new employee orientation. Proper onboarding within the first week by HR before being thrown in the "deep end" by your department.</p>

# 04

## COMMUNITY

WHAT CAN WE DO TO BUILD OR REBUILD CONNECTIONS,  
MOTIVATION, AND EXCITEMENT FOR COMMUNITY AT CSUCI?  
HOW CAN WE ENCOURAGE CONNECTIONS ACROSS TEAMS?



## COMMUNITY: TOPICS & SUGGESTIONS

Topics of Discussion	Suggested Actions
Anonymity and skepticism prevent healthy generation of change	Create excitement, motivation, and conversation across departments and teams.
Nostalgia can undermine data-based change initiatives	Rebuild employee excitement and connection to CSUCI's identity and mission
Feelings of being disconnected/isolated.	Reimagine campus-wide events to build community. It doesn't have to be intense or expensive (ex: movie night, family picnic, etc.)



05

## DEIA

HOW CAN WE BETTER ENSURE ACCESSIBILITY AT CSUCI  
FOR PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES?

WHAT MUST WE DO TO ENSURE DEIA PROGRESS?



# DEIA: TOPICS & SUGGESTIONS

Topics of Discussion	Suggested Actions
Some buildings, campus space and rooms can be difficult to access for those with certain disabilities	A disability consultant could be brought on to make sure the campus is accessible and that any construction projects or future changes are done with accessibility in mind.
Accessibility for all vs. requesting accommodations	Events should strive for a level of accessibility for all, rather than require individuals with disabilities to request needed accommodations. If such wording is added to invitations for events, it should be inclusive of all participants (not just aimed at students with disabilities)
Lack of clarity/understanding for some employees on how to get accommodations for disabilities while at work	Have someone in HR and/or DASS with specific training to assist any faculty who need accommodations. In both cases, having employees who do have disabilities consult on these processes would go a long way - this would reflect the sentiment “nothing about us without us.”
Insufficient diversity in senior-level roles	Ensure diversity at every level, including senior leadership





## DEIA: TOPICS & SUGGESTIONS, CONTINUED

Topics of Discussion	Suggested Actions
DEIA work compromised by re-compartmentalization of units	Hold a broad DEI meeting every quarter
No senior diversity officer	Hire a compliance/equity/deia officer to assist with foundations and action planning of DEIA efforts. Expand our DEIA office to include staff and resource infrastructure needed to do the work our campus needs.
Retaining cluster hires	Support cluster hires in meaningful and material ways.
Openness to DEIA learning but insufficient time to do it	Make more space for people to engage with DEIA work (alleviate the overwork).
Cultural taxation	Provide faculty of color release time to serve and accommodate demand for their (affective & occupational) labor.



06

## ORGANIZATIONAL EFFECTIVENESS

HOW CAN THE CAMPUS COMMUNITY BE ENGAGED IN  
IDENTIFYING NEEDS AND IDEAS FOR IMPROVEMENT?  
HOW MIGHT DECISIONS BE VETTED BEFORE IMPLEMENTATION?



# ORGANIZATIONAL EFFECTIVENESS: TOPICS & SUGGESTIONS

Topics of Discussion	Suggested Actions
Need clear ideas for how each member of the campus can help address shared problems	Engage stakeholders in coming up with ideas for recommending improvements in operations and processes that are not currently functioning well
Organizational structure equity and efficacy	Examine parity/equity/effectiveness across divisions and units
Vagueness in PDs	Incentivize clarity of PDs and org structures to minimize sense of precipitous decision making; ensure clarity of org charts across divisions
Differing organizational cultures and values (e.g., valuing of dissent) makes working across campus difficult when decisions need to be made	Recommendation is strategic workforce development. We've never had a centralized structure for workforce development.



07

## PROFESSIONAL GROWTH

HOW CAN SUPERVISORS BE SUPPORTED AND ACCOUNTABLE  
FOR HEARING AND UNDERSTANDING STAFF NEEDS?  
HOW CAN PD AND PROFESSIONAL ADVANCEMENT BE LINKED?



# PROFESSIONAL GROWTH: TOPICS & SUGGESTIONS

Topics of Discussion	Suggested Actions
When positions are not understood, distrust follows	Annual staff & management training programs (Ex: training around management style, communication style, strengths finder).
Examine enrollment through workforce development lens (i.e., how/does student enrollment drop connect with loss of staff?)	Enrollment management should include efforts to retain staff (e.g., provide opportunities for managers to learn how to build trust with employees).
Low morale and staff attrition	Managers identify working styles, needs, and wants of employees and respond appropriately.

# PROFESSIONAL GROWTH, CONTINUED

Topics of Discussion	Suggested Actions
"Only way to move up is to move out"	Professional Development for Career Progression and current position skills, a pathway towards this which feeds retention.
Size and culture of some divisions create opportunities for unhelpful criticism	<p>We suggest that there should be more requirements for campus leaders/managers to receive regular training regarding employee appreciation, to increase employees' sense of appreciation and belonging.</p> <p>Admins: Listen to staff, help meet needs expressed. We need to capture the things that staff say that they need in their supervisors in order to be effective and feel valued/heard -- and then operationalize those findings (can collect some of these data in CLC spaces)</p>





08

## TRANSITIONS

WHAT AND HOW MUST WE LEARN ABOUT STAFF ATTRITION?  
WHAT MUST WE DO TO ENSURE BUSINESS CONTINUITY  
DESPITE STAFF ATTRITION?



# TRANSITIONS: TOPICS & SUGGESTIONS

Topics of Discussion	Suggested Actions
Employee attrition affects campus culture and student success	Contingency plans in times of lean staffing and staff exiting (“business continuity”). Properly documenting processes and procedures.
Leadership changes inhibit progress	Create transition plan that allows for smooth moves from leader to leader -- succession planning.
Understanding staff attrition	Having exit surveys of staff and transparency in how information from exit surveys is being used.  Provide reports on staff attrition; tangible goals and outcomes needed
Some hampering of productivity in shared spaces	Ensure equity of space



09

## TRUST

WHY ARE “SAFE SPACES” FOR EMPLOYEES NEEDED?

HOW CAN TRUST BETWEEN SUPERVISOR AND SUPERVISEE BE FACILITATED AND BUILT?



# TRUST: TOPICS & SUGGESTIONS

Topics of Discussion	Suggested Actions
Issues of trust and fear of retaliation	<p>Create multiple safe spaces or places for employee issues while honoring confidentiality. Resources need to be proactive (Ex: Ombuds visit departments frequently, not the other way around).</p> <p>Create ways to be "professionally angry" that take into account power dynamics</p>
CLC participants report feeling heard	Institutionalize CLCs. Critical Friends Groups/Critical Learning Communities can create safe spaces across divisions and can help identify systemic vs. cultural vs. management issues.



10

## WORK EQUITY

HOW CAN WE MEASURE AND ENSURE EQUITY IN WORKLOAD?  
HOW CAN WE ENSURE FAIRNESS IN TELEWORKING  
OPPORTUNITIES AND OPTIONS?

# WORK EQUITY: TOPICS & SUGGESTIONS

Topics of Discussion	Suggested Actions
Balancing desire for flexibility in work schedule with equity (i.e., flexible/inflexible work schedule impacts morale and trust)	<p>The campus should allow for increased flexibility and acceptance of working conditions (for example, allowing hybrid positions or remote work days) for employees to meet a variety of needs.</p> <p>Implement a hybrid schedule that is fair. Each division could be allowed for one work-from-home day that still allows for continuity of business. Employees should be given agency to take their WFH day or not.</p>
F22 survey validated CLC conversations on feeling overwhelmed, particularly in understaffed areas. Pre-covid/covid/post-covid indistinguishable in this regard.	<p>Ensure equity in workload. Analyze capacities, identify what can and can't be accomplished, and adjust responsibilities accordingly and equally.</p> <p>Take President's messaging to action. Initiate conversations with supervisors, with units. May be tough to have these conversations -- look for mini-wins. How can each area be able to identify and create mini-wins? What is the accountability?</p>



## MAIN THEMES FROM TABLE DISCUSSIONS

March 29, 2023

1. Organizational Effectiveness
2. Accountability & Work Equity
3. Onboarding and Training Communication
4. Community & Identity
5. Trust & Change



On April 6, 2023, 44 CLC-generated recommendations were ranked by participants (listed on slides 34-35) and by executive leadership.

CLC recommendations were ranked by impact and anticipated timeline of that impact: immediately, in 2-3 years, in 4-5 years, and “no impact.” Slide 32, “0-3 years” shows results of “immediate” and “2-3 years” combined.

The next four slides show the top-10 ranked recommendations by each anticipated timeline. See this [accessible version](#) which includes content for images on slides 30-33.

Of 44 recommendations generated by CLCs through their 2022-23 study of campus climate survey findings (F20 and F22), these were the top 10 identified for having **immediate positive impact** as evaluated by CLC participants and executive leadership on 4/06/2023.

[Accessible version](#)

### Top 10 Recommendations for Having Immediate Positive Impact

10a. Work Equity: The campus should allow for increased flexibility and acceptance of working conditions (for example, allowing hybrid positions or remote work days) for employees to meet a variety of needs.	1st
10b. Work Equity: Implement a hybrid schedule that is fair. Each division could be allowed for one work-from-home day that still allows for continuity of business. Employees should be given agency to take their WFH day or not.	2nd
9c. Trust: Institutionalize CLCs. Critical Friends Groups/Critical Learning Communities can create safe spaces across divisions and can help identify systemic vs. cultural vs. management issues.	3rd
7e. Professional Growth: We suggest that there should be more requirements for campus leaders/managers to receive regular training regarding employee appreciation, to increase employees' sense of appreciation and belonging.	Tied for 4th
3d. Communication: We propose more purposeful onboarding processes for all new (or new to their position) staff, faculty and administration to increase staff connection and morale. This year's onboarding for new tenure track faculty was a step in the right direction.	Tied for 4th
10c. Work Equity: Ensure equity in workload. Analyze capacities, identify what can and can't be accomplished, and adjust responsibilities accordingly and equally.	5th
4c. Community: Reimagine campus-wide events to build community. It doesn't have to be intense or expensive (ex: movie night, family picnic, etc.).	Tied for 6th
4a. Community: Create excitement, motivation, and conversation across departments and teams.	Tied for 6th
7b. Professional Growth: Enrollment management should include efforts to retain staff (e.g., provide opportunities for managers to learn how to build trust with employees).	Tied for 7th
2b. Career Advancement: Ensure staff awareness of options and opportunities for advancement (IRPs, In-class, Re-class).	Tied for 7th

Of 44 recommendations generated by CLCs through their 2022-23 study of campus climate survey findings (F20 and F22), these were the top 10 identified for having **positive impact in 2-3 years** as evaluated by CLC participants and executive leadership on 4/06/2023.

[Accessible version](#)

Top 10 Recommendations for Having Positive Impact in 2-3 Years	
2a. Career Advancement: Connect professional development with career progression.	1st
5h. DEIA: Make more space for people to engage with DEIA work (alleviate the overwork).	Tied for 2nd
8b. Transitions: Create transition plan that allows for smooth moves from leader to leader – succession planning.	Tied for 2nd
8a. Transitions: Contingency plans in times of lean staffing and staff exiting (“business continuity”). Properly documenting processes and procedures.	Tied for 2nd
7a. Professional Growth: Annual staff & management training programs (Ex: training around management style, communication style, strengths finder).	Tied for 2nd
7f. Professional Growth: Admins: Listen to staff, help meet needs expressed. We need to capture the things that staff say that they need in their supervisors in order to be effective and feel valued/heard – and then operationalize those findings (can collect some of these data in CLC spaces).	Tied for 3rd
6b. Organizational Effectiveness: Examine parity/equity/effectiveness across divisions and units.	Tied for 3rd
1a. Accountability: Implement a system for vetting decisions before implementing them. Ensure stakeholder feedback at every stage of decision making – rework the decision, the policy, etc., – member-checking built into decisions.	Tied for 4th
9a. Trust: Create multiple safe spaces or places for employee issues while honoring confidentiality. Resources need to be proactive (Ex: Ombuds visit departments frequently, not the other way around).	Tied for 4th
4b. Community: Rebuild employee excitement and connection to CSUCI's identity and mission.	Tied for 4th



Of 44 recommendations generated by CLCs through their 2022-23 study of campus climate survey findings (F20 and F22), this slide shows the top 11 results for **“immediate impact”** and **“impact in 2-3 years”** combined, as evaluated by CLC participants and executive leadership.

[Accessible version](#)

### Top 11 (5-way tie for 3rd) Recommendations for Having Positive Impact in 0-3 Years -- Combining "Immediate" and "2-3 Years" Results

9c. Trust: Institutionalize CLCs. Critical Friends Groups/Critical Learning Communities can create safe spaces across divisions and can help identify systemic vs. cultural vs. management issues.	1st
7a. Professional Growth: Annual staff & management training programs (Ex: training around management style, communication style, strengths finder).	Tied for 2nd
5c. DEIA: Have someone in HR and/or DASS with specific training to assist any faculty who need accommodations. In both cases, having employees who do have disabilities consult on these processes would go a long way - this would reflect the sentiment “nothing about us without us.”	Tied for 2nd
2b. Career Advancement: Ensure staff awareness of options and opportunities for advancement (IRPs, In-class, Re-class).	Tied for 2nd
7e. Professional Growth: We suggest that there should be more requirements for campus leaders/managers to receive regular training regarding employee appreciation, to increase employees’ sense of appreciation and belonging.	Tied for 2nd
3d. Communication: We propose more purposeful onboarding processes for all new (or new to their position) staff, faculty and administration to increase staff connection and morale. This year’s onboarding for new tenure track faculty was a step in the right direction.	Tied for 2nd
8a. Transitions: Contingency plans in times of lean staffing and staff exiting (“business continuity”). Properly documenting processes and procedures.	Tied for 3rd
4b. Community: Rebuild employee excitement and connection to CSUCI's identity and mission.	Tied for 3rd
4a. Community: Create excitement, motivation, and conversation across departments and teams.	Tied for 3rd
10c. Work Equity: Ensure equity in workload. Analyze capacities, identify what can and can’t be accomplished, and adjust responsibilities accordingly and equally.	Tied for 3rd
10a. Work Equity: The campus should allow for increased flexibility and acceptance of working conditions (for example, allowing hybrid positions or remote work days) for employees to meet a variety of needs.	Tied for 3rd

Of 44 recommendations generated by CLCs through their 2022-23 study of campus climate survey findings (F20 and F22), these were the top 10 evaluated for having **positive impact in 4-5 years**, as evaluated by CLC participants and executive leadership on 4/06/2023.

[Accessible version](#)

Top 10 Recommendations for Having Positive Impact in 4-5 Years	
5g. DEIA: Support cluster hires in meaningful and material ways.	1st
6d. Organizational Effectiveness: Recommendation is strategic workforce development. We've never had a centralized structure for workforce development.	2nd
5f. DEIA: Hire a compliance/equity/deia officer to assist with foundations and action planning of DEIA efforts. Expand our DEIA office to include staff and resource infrastructure needed to do the work our campus needs.	3rd
2a. Career Advancement: Connect professional development with career progression.	4th
5i. DEIA: Provide faculty of color release time to serve and accommodate demand for their (affective & occupational) labor.	Tied for 5th
8e. Transitions: Ensure equity of space.	Tied for 5th
5d. DEIA: Ensure diversity at every level, including senior leadership.	Tied for 5th
10d. Work Equity: Take President's messaging to action. Initiate conversations with supervisors, with units. May be tough to have these conversations – look for mini-wins. How can each area be able to identify and create mini-wins? What is the accountability?	Tied for 5th
3c. Communication: Create and implement a system for institutional memory on this campus—for initiatives, definitions, historical context, overlap, and continuity.	6th
6b. Organizational Effectiveness: Examine parity/equity/effectiveness across divisions and units.	7th



Should you wish to comment upon any of the CLC recommendations, please do via this Qualtrics survey by Wednesday, April 19.

*Note: President Yao's video message, which wasn't published until April 12, indicated responses due by April 13. The correct due date for feedback is April 19.*

Results of the discussions that President Yao and Cabinet have had with CLC participants along with Qualtrics feedback from the link below will inform next steps.

Campus Community Comments and/or Questions on CLC Recommendations

CSUCI  
Critical Learning  
Collectives 2022-23



## Thank you to CLC Coaches---

**CLC Participants: 56**

Students: 6 (0 coaches)

Staff: 30 (5 coaches)

Faculty: 8 (3 coaches)

Admin: 12 (4 coaches)

CLC 1: Students	Annie White and Kaia Tollefson
CLC 2: Staff	Monica Ocampo and Wendy Olson
CLC 3: Staff	Sara Alcalá and Courtney Gross
CLC 4: MPP	Mark Patterson
CLC 5: Faculty/Staff	Raquel Baker
CLC 6: Faculty/Staff	Lorna Gonzalez and Lydia Dixon
CLC 7: MPP/Staff	Bethany Bañuelos and Tanya Gonzalez

CSUCI  
Critical Learning  
Collectives 2022-23



# ... and Participants

Fope Adesina	Jennifer Conkwright	Amanda Frazier Timpson	Honey Krueger	Jennifer Perry	Kristin Steiner,
Jules Balén	Trina Darakjy	Kim Gregory	Chiara Lamb	Dani Rae	Venus Tamayo
Cameron Bartosiewicz	Edna Davoudi	Karen Gundelfinger	Michael Lee	Amanda Sanchez	Mirka Vargas
Roxane Beigel-Coryell	Giselle Dominguez	Jaime Hannans	Susan Lefevre	Amber Sanchez	Kevin Viado
Lindsay Billett	Grace Durst	Jennifer Herrera-Alvarado	Christell Martinez	Julia Shapiro	Kara Waycasy
José Castro-Sotomayor	Brenda Estrada	Brittany Hong	Joanna Murphy	Rebecca Slocum	Greg Wood
Viviana Celaya	Stephanie Franklin	Karly Ibrahim	William Nutt	Kellen Smith	Matt Zivott
		Kathleen Klompfen	Alex Padilla		

Thank you for responding to the Fall 2022 call. Another will be sent in early Fall 2023.