**An Investigation of Ethnic Identity Development**

Malik Aqueel Raheem,
>       California State University, Fresno
Charles E. Myers
Scott A. Wickman,
>       Northern Illinois University

**An Investigation of Ethnic Identity Development and Counselor Educator Comfort and Competence: Addressing Multicultural Issues**

ABSTRACT: Supervisors assist counselors-in-training in becoming multiculturally competent counselors. Researchers examined the relationship between supervisors' ($N = 167$) racial/ethnic identity development status and their competence as well as comfort addressing multicultural issues in supervision. Results indicated significant interaction between gender, multicultural supervision skills, and ethnic identity. Data analysis showed improvement from previous research related to counselor educator competence and comfort addressing multicultural issues.

In an increasingly diversifying world, the need for competent counselor educators and supervisors comfortable in addressing cultural, ethnic, and racial issues has never been greater. However, these issues in supervision have received limited empirical attention. Although ethnic identity development is essential in multicultural counseling competence (Bhat & Davis, 2007; Helms & Cook, 1999), there is a dearth of studies examining supervisor comfort discussing multicultural issues. Considering inherent power and privilege differences within supervisory relationships, and how those differences may affect the supervision process, the restricted body of research was unexpected. Without what Wickman (1999; Wickman & Campbell, 2003) termed an *invitation for repair*, or taking a one-down position and overtly requesting correction on misunderstood (in this case, multicultural) issues, many supervision relationships will not establish a strong working alliance and supervisees may view supervisors as unquestionable authority figures.

For more than 30 years, the American Counseling Association (ACA) and Council for Accreditation of Counseling and Related Educational Programs (CACREP) have emphasized multiculturalism and social justice in counselor preparation (ACA, 2005). In the CACREP 2009 standards, counseling programs "provide an understanding of the cultural context of relationships, issues, and trends in multicultural society" (p. 10). The multicultural counseling movement has revolutionized the training of counselors, affecting how they think about mental health and approach clients (D'Andrea & Heckman, 2008). Counselor training focuses on preparing counselors-in-training to help clients examine their issues in counseling. Multicultural counseling competence in supervision emphasizes facilitating counselors-in-training who are initially fearful and unaware in addressing personal biases by assisting them to confront personal biases (Arredondo, Tovar-Blank, & Parham, 2008).

The Association of Multicultural Counseling and Development's multicultural competencies (Arredondo et al., 1996) highlighted the importance of counselors being multiculturally sensitive and competent. Arredondo and colleagues defined multicultural constructs, making the phrase "multicultural counseling" more concrete and clarifying the difference between *multiculturalism* (differences of ethnicity, race, and culture) and *diversity* (differences of age, gender, sexual orientation, etc.).

Culturally competent counselors need to be knowledgeable and sensitive to ethnic and racial issues. *Ethnic identity* is an aspect of a person's social identity and self-concept derived from knowledge of membership in a social group and having value and emotional significance attached to membership in the group (Phinney, 1992). *Racial identity* is "one's psychological response to one's race; racial identity reflects the extent to which one identifies with a particular racial or cultural group and how that identification influences perceptions, emotions, and behaviors toward people from other groups" (Parham, White, & Ajuma, 1999, p. 57).

Supervision models attending to multicultural issues have a positive effect on supervisory working alliances (Constantine, 2001). However, Constantine and Sue (2007) found that many supervisors have limited training in multicultural competencies. Furthermore, even among supervisors with prior multicultural counseling coursework, unconscious racism may manifest in the supervision process, having detrimental effects on the supervisory working alliance, and, ultimately, supervisees' therapeutic relationships with clients.

Being a multicultural supervisor not only requires awareness of multicultural issues but also competence and comfort addressing multicultural issues while supervising counselors and counselors-in-training. Because of the lack of recent empirical research available, the first author wanted to find out (a) counselor educators' current levels of comfort and competence addressing

multicultural issues and (b) the relationship between those levels and ethnic identity development. In other words, this study' focused on the relationship between (a) ethnic identity development and (b) the comfort and competence of counselor educators and supervisors, including counselor-educators-and-supervisors-in-training, addressing multicultural issues. Counselor educators and supervisors have completed advanced professional counseling preparation and earned a doctorate with the intent of becoming a university faculty member in counselor preparation or an advanced clinical counselor and supervisor (ACA, 2005). Counselor educators-in-training are currently completing requirements for a doctorate in counselor education and supervision.

Two research questions guided this study. First, *what are the competence and comfort levels of recently trained counselor educators and counselor-educators-in-training addressing supervision multicultural issues?* Second, what is the relationship between these levels and racial/ethnic identity development?

## Method

### Participants

The study sample consisted of recently trained counselor educators and supervisors who graduated from a CACREP-accredited doctoral counselor education and supervision program within the past three years, and current doctoral students in CACREP-accredited counselor education and supervision programs. For statistical rigor, a threshold of 120 participants was set. Initially, 189 participants responded. However, 22 participants did not complete the study, resulting in a sample size of 167 participants. Group demographics included female people of Color ($n = 39$), White females ($n = 80$), male people of Color ($n = 17$), and White males ($n = 31$).

### Data Collection

The first author recruited participants by advertising to CACREP universities and on CESNET-L, the counselor education and supervision listserv. Participants completed a demographic questionnaire and survey. Study results include no individual participant information, only aggregated data.

### Instruments

The Multicultural Supervision Scale (MSS; Sangganjanavanich, 2008) consists of 40 5-point Likert scale items designed to assess counseling supervisor competence and comfort discussing multicultural issues in supervision. The MSS has three subscales: Factor I, *Supervisory Skills*, examines supervisor multicultural competence during supervision. Factor II, *Attitudes and Beliefs*, relates to comfort, attitudes, and beliefs supervisors have toward multiculturalism in supervision. Factor III, *Stereotypes Toward Diverse Populations*, measures biases, stereotypes, and prejudice that may affect the supervision process. Factor III is reversed scored. In other words, the lower the score the better the person performs on this section. Coefficient $\alpha$ is reported for the total MSS as $\alpha = .88$ (Factor I $\alpha = .78$, Factor II $\alpha = .89$, and Factor III $\alpha = .89$).

The Multigroup Ethnic Identity Measure (MEIM; Phinney, 1992) contains 20, 4-point Likert-scale items designed to access the dominant status of ethnic identity development. The overall MEIM coefficient is reported as $\alpha = .81$. The MEIM has three subscales: (a) developmental, cognitive component, and affirmation ($\alpha = .78$); (b) belonging and commitment ($\alpha = .80$); and (c) other-group orientation ($\alpha = .83$).

**Results**

**Research Question One**

In analyzing the first research question, determining  recently trained counselor educators' and counselor-educators'-in-training comfort and competence levels addressing multicultural issues in supervision, a cross-tabulation of gender, ethnic/racial development, and MSS was conducted. The MSS produced four scores: an overall score of multicultural comfort and competence as well as scores for each of the three factor subscales. Table 1 presents distribution by gender with the MSS and the three factor subscales. No significant differences were found between gender mean scores on the MSS; however, general tendencies by gender were noted. Males scored higher on the overall MSS score ($M = 1.75$) as compared to females ($M = 1.72$). These scores suggest that males perceived themselves as having an overall higher level of multicultural supervision competency, in particular with having lower stereotypes of diverse populations, than did females. However, females scored higher on the Factor I, *Supervisory Skills*, subscale ($M = 1.80$) and higher on the Factor II, *Attitudes and Beliefs*, subscale ($M = 1.68$), as compared to males, ($M = 1.67$) and ($M = 1.56$) on the Factor III, *Stereotype of Diverse Populations*, subscale females outperformed males ($M = 1.46$) and ($M = 1.30$) respectively. These results suggest that females viewed themselves as possessing higher levels of multicultural supervisory skills and multicultural attitudes and beliefs than did males.

Table 1

*MSS Correlations, Means, and Standard Deviations*

|  | People of Color ($n = 56$) | | White ($n = 111$) | | Male ($n = 48$) | | Female ($n = 119$) | | Total ($n = 167$) | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
|  | M | SD | M | SD | M | SD | M | SD | M | SD |
| MSS | 1.71 | .456 | 1.74 | .441 | 1.75 | .438 | 1.72 | .450 | 1.73 | .445 |
| Factor I | 1.82 | .386 | 1.73 | .446 | 1.67 | .476 | 1.80 | .403 | 1.76 | .448 |
| Factor II | 1.63 | .489 | 1.66 | .477 | 1.56 | .501 | 1.68 | .468 | 1.65 | .479 |
| Factor III | 1.25 | .434 | 1.39 | .491 | 1.46 | .506 | 1.30 | .459 | 1.35 | .477 |

Table 2 shows race/ethnicity distribution of the overall MSS score and the three factor subscales. Ethnicity/racial identity development showed statistical significance with MSS Factor I, *Supervisory Skills,* ($M = 1.82$) and Factor III *Stereotype of Diverse Populations* ($M = 1.63$), subscales, indicating that People of Color reported having higher levels of multicultural supervisory skills and lower levels of stereotypes of diverse populations than White participants. General tendencies were noted for the overall MSS score and each factor subscale. White participants scored higher on the overall MSS score ($M = 1.74$) and on Factor II, *Attitudes and Beliefs*, subscale ($M = 1.66$) when compared to Persons of Color, ($M = 1.71$) and ($M = 1.63$) respectively. These scores suggest that White participants perceived themselves as having an overall higher level of multicultural supervision competency and multicultural attitudes and beliefs than did Persons of Color. In contrast, Persons of Color scored higher on Factor I, *Supervisory Skills,* subscale ($M = 1.82$) and lower on Factor III, *Stereotype of Diverse Populations* subscale, ($M = 1.25$) than White participants, ($M = 1.73$) and ($M = 1.39$) respectively. These results suggest that Persons of Color viewed themselves as possessing higher levels of multicultural supervisory skills, in particular having lower stereotypes of diverse populations than did White participants.

**Multicultural Supervision Scale**

Table 2 presents scores analyzed with MSS score x ethnicity/race. Cross-tabulations of results for ethnicity indicated that 72% of participants who self-identified as Persons of Color scored in the high range on the MSS. Cross-tabulation results for participants who self-identified as White indicated 74% scored in the high range, suggesting that a higher percentage of White participants view themselves as being competent in multicultural supervision. Cross-tabulation results for Factor I, *Supervisory Skills*, of the MSS show that 82% of participants who self-identified as a Person of Color and 73% of participants who self-identified as White scored in the high range, suggesting that a greater percentage of Persons of Color have a high level of multicultural supervision skills. Cross-tabulation results for Factor II, *Attitudes and Beliefs*, of the MSS show that 63% of the participants who self-identified as Person of Color scored in the high range as compared to 65% of the participants who self-identified as White, indicating that a greater percentage of White participants scored higher on multicultural attitudes and skills than Persons of Color. Cross-tabulations results for Factor III, *Stereotypes toward Diverse Populations*, of the MSS showed that 25% of participants who identified as Persons of Color and 35% participants who identified White scored in the high range, suggesting Persons of Color are less likely than White participants to have stereotypes toward diverse populations.

Table 2 presents an analysis of total MSS score and gender cross-tabulation results, finding 75% of males and 82% of females scoring in the high range, indicating that for the variable gender, both males and females reported an overall high ability addressing multicultural issues in supervision. Cross-tabulation results of Factor I, *Supervisory Skills*, of the MSS showed that 67% of males and 80% of females scored in the high range, indicating that females appeared to be more competent addressing multicultural issues than males. Cross-tabulation results of Factor II, *Attitudes and Beliefs*, of the MSS showed 56% of males and 68% of females scored in the high range, suggesting that females may have a greater sense of comfort than males addressing multicultural issues in supervision. Cross-tabulation results of Factor III, *Stereotypes toward Diverse Populations*, of the MSS showed 46% of males and 26% of females scored in the high range, suggesting that females may have lower internalized assumptions that may influence the supervisory working alliance.

Table 2

*MSS Percentage of Variables*

| Variable | Percentage | | Percentage | |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| | Persons of Color | White | Male | Female |
| MSS | | | | |
| Poor Multiculturalism | 28% | 26% | 25% | 18% |
| Good Multiculturalism | 72% | 74% | 75% | 82% |
| Factor I: Supervisory Skills | | | | |
| Low Supervisory Skills | 18% | 27% | 33% | 20% |
| High Supervisory Skills | 82% | 73% | 67% | 80% |
| Factor II: Attitudes and Belief | | | | |
| Low Attitudes and Belief | 37% | 35% | 44% | 32% |
| High Attitudes and Belief | 63% | 65% | 56% | 68% |
| Factor III: Stereotypes of Diverse Populations | | | | |
| Low Stereotype of Diverse Populations | 75% | 65% | 54% | 74% |
| High Stereotype of Diverse Populations | 25% | 35% | 46% | 26% |

**Research Question Two**

To analyze the second research question regarding the influence of racial/ethnic development has on recently trained counselor educators' and counselor educators'-in-training competence and comfort levels addressing multicultural issues in supervision, a hierarchical regression model was created to investigate the relationship between People of Color and White counselor educators MEIM scores and their scores on the MSS.

**Multigroup Ethnic Identity Measure**

MEIM scores represent ethnic identity acceptance (Phinney, 1992). Table 3 summarizes the distribution of MEIM scores as referenced by gender. Results show that female participants had a higher overall MEIM mean score ($M = 1.54$) than male participant's ($M = 1.40$) and higher MEIM factor scales. Table 3 summarizes the distribution of MEIM scores as referenced by ethnicity/race. Results show that White participants had a higher overall MEIM mean score ($M = 1.85$) than Persons of Color ($M = 1.65$) and higher MEIM factor scales.

A hierarchical Regression Model: Race/Ethnicity x MEIM was performed. Both variables of race/ethnicity ($n = 167$) and MEIM ($n = 167$) scores were found to be statistically significant predictors of competence and comfort addressing multicultural issues in supervision. Because substantial departures from normality can adversely affect regression analyses, data were examined to ensure that they met regression assumptions of normality, linearity, and homoscedasity. Results for the MSS total score and the three subscale factors were as follows: $F (6,334) = 24.59, p < .01; F (6,222) = 18.69, p < .01; F (6,266) = 27.48, p < .05$, and $F (6,233) = 21.24, p < .01$. These scores show the interactions between Ethnicity/Race x MEIM x MSS were significant ($p < .01$). In other words, participant race/ethnicity predicted MSS scores with statistical significance. Ethnic/racial identity development as defined by the MEIM was a significant predictor of the participants' MSS score. Hierarchical regression results indicated that the overall model significantly predicts MSS score, or participant ability to feel competent and comfortable addressing multicultural issues in supervision.

Table 3

*MEIM Correlations, Means, and Standard Deviations*

| | People of Color ($n = 56$) | | White ($n = 111$) | | Male ($n = 48$) | | Female ($n = 119$) | | Total ($n = 167$) | |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| | M | SD | M | SD | M | SD | M | SD | M | SD |
| MEIM | 1.65 | .493 | 1.85 | .366 | 1.40 | .496 | 1.54 | .501 | 1.50 | .502 |
| Ethnic Identity | 1.59 | .507 | 1.95 | .223 | 1.60 | .496 | 1.79 | .412 | 1.73 | .444 |
| Ethnic Achieve. | 1.82 | .393 | 1.97 | .160 | 1.87 | .337 | 1.90 | .337 | 1.89 | .314 |
| Affirmation/ Belonging | 1.00 | .000 | 1.00 | .000 | 1.00 | 1.00 | 1.00 | 1.00 | 1.00 | .000 |
| Other Group Orient. | 1.82 | .393 | 1.97 | .160 | 1.89 | .312 | 1.95 | .222 | 1.93 | .251 |

**Discussion**

**Question One**

This study's findings contradict previous findings on supervisor comfort and competence addressing multicultural issues with supervisees. Constantine (2001) found 70% of counseling supervisors did *not* feel comfortable discussing multicultural issues in supervision. In the current study, participants scored high on all MSS factors. These results suggest that CACREP-accredited doctoral programs have made progress in teaching, encouraging, and supporting counselor educators to be self-aware of personal biases, stereotypes, and unconscious racism.

This study's results also suggest counselor educators have increased their comfort and competence addressing multicultural issues in supervision since Constantine's (2001) study. In questions one and two, a preponderance of counselor educators scored within the high range of MSS overall score.

Counselor educators train, educate, and supervise counselors-in-training from a growth and development model. Participants were able to demonstrate with these scores increases in developmental complexity in the professions' ability to be self-aware of biases, stereotypes, and prejudices. Results from questions one and two were contrary to previous literature on counseling supervisors' comfort and competence in addressing multicultural issues.

## Question Two

Helms and Cook (1999) wrote that racial and ethnic identity development is a crucial variable in determining counselor ability to operate effectively in cross-racial dyads. Counselor educators and supervisors of Color are more likely to experience multicultural issues in their personal and professional lives, which increases the necessity of addressing issues. Counselor educators and supervisors of Color may have increased empathy related to diversity issues in supervision, wanting to ensure that supervisees become more self-aware and multiculturally competent. We also believe that counselor educators' of Color increased experience with multicultural issues in their personal and professional lives implies that, because of lack of privilege, many female counselor educators also may have a stronger sense of empathy. In other words, females, especially females of Color, have a lack of privilege and this lack assists them in becoming more self-aware of biases and stereotypes they may have internalized.

There was a statistically significant difference ($p < .05$) in scores of participants of Color on the three factor subscales of the MSS, whereas both participants of Color and White female participants were significant ($p < .05$). These experiences may create a greater sense of urgency for counselor educators of Color in addressing stereotypes toward diverse populations.

This study's findings support ethnic identity development literature. Previous researchers (Constantine, 2001; Helms, 1982) discussed how advanced ethnic identity development increases cognitive complexity. This study supports the assumption that advanced cognitive complexity increases counselor educators' ability to be multiculturally competent.

## Summary of Synthesis of Results

### MSS

The total score on the MSS indicates that in this study's sample, counselor educators' comfort and competence addressing multicultural issues in supervision, is currently high. In addition, a close analysis of MSS sub-factors suggested that counselor educator comfort and competence was high and within an acceptable range. These results indicate participants felt comfortable or competent addressing culturally sensitive issues related to stereotypes toward diverse populations in supervision. In other words, participants for this study perceive themselves to address assumptions, expectations, biases, and stereotypical issues in supervision.

Counselor educators are responsible for training, educating, and preparing future counselors. Counselor educators have a responsibility as trainers and educators of counselors to be multiculturally competent and comfortable in addressing multicultural issues in supervision and preparing counselors-in-training to be multiculturally competent. Multiculturally competent counselors are in a better position to assist their clients, in particular clients of Color.

**MEIM**

Clients benefit from multiculturally competent counselors by receiving counseling services that address their needs in a multiculturally competent paradigm. Multicultural literature and research shows that increasing counselor cognitive complexity increases comprehension of multicultural issues and dynamics (Constantine et al., 2008). Counselors' increased comprehension of multicultural issues and dynamics facilitate development in multicultural competence in skills, ability, beliefs, and knowledge. Counselor educators' increased MEIM scores demonstrate an increase in their comfort, security, and acceptance of their ethnic identity and comfort with other groups.

This result is encouraging for multicultural counseling competence and multicultural supervision, as many counselor educators enter academia, agency work, consultation, private practice, and so forth. Regardless of employment setting, counselor educators are leaders in the training, preparing, and developing of future multiculturally competent counselors. That counselor educators be competent and comfortable addressing multicultural issues is essential. This result appears to indicate counselor educators have become more comfortable and competent addressing multicultural issues in supervision. The multicultural counseling movement has revolutionized traditional training methods of counselor educators, supervisors, and counselors on how they think about mental health and their approach to clients, consistent with D'Andrea and Heckman's (2008) findings.

## Implications

This study reflects a multicultural-competency trend consistent with ACA's (2005) guidelines on multicultural education, training, research, practice, and organizational change for counselors and supervisors. As professors, counselor educators have the responsibility to train, develop, and educate multiculturally competent counselors and need to be comfortable and competent addressing multicultural issues.

**Implications for Counselor Educators**

This study's results emphasize the importance of counselor educators' ability to be self-aware, competent, and comfortable addressing multicultural issues with counselors-in-training. Counselor educators need to use supervision to attend to multicultural concerns. Counselor educators have a primary responsibility for developing of multiculturally competent counselors. Multiculturally competent counselors are more likely to establish therapeutic relationships with clients, especially clients of Color. Multicultural competence is essential to the ethical principles of not harming and  helping all clients. Through conscious effort, counselor educators may increase ethnic/racial identity development and become multiculturally competent to better prepare future counselors. Requesting and expecting others to begin growth and development is difficult without already having done so.

Counselor educators who accept this challenge to increase attachment and attention to their ethnic identity can model this process for supervisees, while increasing comfort and

competence addressing multicultural issues. By addressing multicultural issues, counselor educators can increase their working alliance with supervisees/counselors-in-training, essential for the fundamental work needed to assist supervisees/counselors-in-training in their work with clients. Counselor educators who are able to model competence and comfort addressing multicultural issues increase the competence and comfort of supervisees/counselors-in-training in multicultural counseling.

## Implications for Counselors

Counseling uses a growth and development model of wellness that continues throughout their personal, professional, and spiritual lifespans. Counselor educators need to challenge themselves to explore their own ethnic identity development and feelings about other ethnic/racial groups. Culturally skilled counselor educators are able to exercise intervention skills on behalf of counselors-in-training to enhance therapeutic relationships with clients of Color. Counselor educators need to increase self-awareness, as self-awareness facilitates possible prejudices and biases coming to the surface. This self-awareness of recently trained counselor educators and counselor educators-in-training will assist counselor educators-in-training and supervising counselors-in-training to become aware of their biases and attitudes that may affect therapeutic relationships with clients. This process will facilitate counselor educators and counselor educators-in-training to become comfortable addressing multicultural issues in education, training, and supervision. By developing multiculturally competent counselors, counselor educators indirectly affect the therapeutic relationship between counselors and clients.

## Clients

Helms and Cook (1999) found that many clients of Color do not believe their counselors understand their perspective and reported that many clients of Color do not return after one clinical session. Clients benefit from counselors providing multiculturally competent services and perceiving that their counselors are attempting to make a connection with them culturally.

## Implications for CACREP Programs

CACREP programs need to continue supporting counselor educators-in-training overcoming fear and resistance to discussing ethnic/racial topics by fostering safe and productive learning environments and increasing education on racial microaggressions. The education and training of counselor educators must aid counselor educators to (a) increase their ability to identify racial microaggressions; (b) understand how racial microaggressions, including their own, detrimentally affect clients of Color; and (c) accept responsibility for taking corrective actions to overcome racial biases.

## Limitations

Although the results of this study are promising, we have identified a number of limitations, discussed below.

## Self-Report

One limitation of this study is that the findings are from self-report assessments. The variable of social desirability needs to be considered. This study did not have any mechanism to verify or cross-reference the accuracy of participant self-reports. The reliance on solely self-report presents a threat to validity.

**Limited Diversity**

A second limitation was the limited number of counselor educators of Color, as well as limited number of males, in this study. The small number of participant ethnic diversity in the study suggests a drastic need to increase recruitment of males of Color into professional counseling and counselor education. The small number of ethnically diverse participants prevented individual analysis of different ethnic groups.

**Recruitment**

A third limitation of this study was the participant recruitment procedure used. The survey was limited to self-selection by members of the CESNET listserv. Participants who have access to the listserv may have unique qualities that may have skewed the results. Participant interest in the research topic may have influenced this cross-sectional study and results.

## Future Research

The results of this study suggest that future research on the counselor educator comfort and competence addressing multicultural issues in supervision is needed to build upon what has been found in this and other studies. Future studies might include both counselor educators and supervisees completing evaluations on counselor educators' ability to address multicultural issues. Supervisee reports would provide a balance to counselor educators' self-report.

Helms and Cook (1999) noted that racial consciousness is a critical consideration in determining counselors' ability to operate successfully in cross-racial dyads. A future study could possibly use Helms and Carter's (1999) racial identity scales, in addition to the MEIM, to increase understanding of how ethnic identity development influences multicultural competence in supervision.

As a result, mental health professionals will be able to better service clients. Ideally, future research will focus on the relationship among supervisor racial identity and competence and comfort discussing multicultural counseling competence in dyadic and triadic supervision. Research may also focus on supervisors' ability to recognize and discuss racial microaggressions with supervisees in dyadic and triadic supervision relationships. Both research possibilities will be important to focus on because of the inherent privilege of the supervisors' position. Recently, doctoral counselor education programs have implemented multicultural training. Programs establishing multicultural counseling training to doctoral students will help increase student cognitive complexity. Multicultural counseling training will challenge some worldviews. thus challenging student schemas and facilitating increased racial identity development, essential to self-awareness. Consequently, supervisors will have an improved competence to assist supervisees with multicultural issues.

## Conclusion

This study's findings provide a critical step toward understanding counselor educators' competence and comfort levels addressing multicultural issues. Participants scored high in their ability to be comfortable and competent addressing multicultural issues. The MSS total score as well as results for its three factors suggest the field of counselor education has made improvements in multicultural supervision since Constantine's (2001) study. The current study has also taken steps toward understanding how ethnic identity development interacts with multicultural competence in counselor educators to increase counselor sensitivity to multicultural issues. It is essential that counselor educators be comfortable and competent discussing,

addressing, and educating on multicultural issues. Results of this study suggest that competence and comfort related to ethnic identity development is essential when addressing multicultural issues in supervision.

As the field of counselor education and supervision advances its commitment to multiculturalism, we concur with Constantine, Smith, Redington, and Owens's (2008) call for counselor educators to deepen their commitment to becoming multiculturally competent. The training at counselor education and supervision CACREP programs needs to include an emphasis on multiculturally competent counselors who are comfortable addressing multicultural issues in supervision itself and within supervisee therapeutic relationships.

References

American Counseling Association. (2005). *ACA code of ethics.* Alexandria, VA: Author.

Arredondo, P., Toporek, R., Brown, S. P., Jones, J., Locke, D. C., Sanchez, J., & Stadler, H. (1996). Operationalization of the multicultural counseling competencies. *Journal of Multicultural Counseling & Development, 24*, 42-78. doi: 10.1002/j.2161-1912.1996.tb00288.x

Arredondo, P., Tovar-Blank, Z. G., & Parham, T. A. (2008). Challenges and promises of becoming a culturally competent counselor in a sociopolitical era of change and empowerment. *Journal of Counseling & Development, 86*, 261-268. doi: 10.1002/j.1556-6678.2008.tb00508.x

Bhat, C. S., & Davis, T. E. (2007). Counseling supervisors' assessment of race, racial identity, and working alliance in supervisory dyads. *Journal of Multicultural Counseling and Development, 35*, 80-91. doi: 10.1002/j.2161-1912.2007.tb00051.x

Constantine, M. G. (2001). Perspectives on multicultural supervision. *Journal of Multicultural Counseling and Development, 29*, 98-101. doi: 10.1002/j.2161-1912.2001.tb00507.x

Constantine, M. G., Smith, L., Redington, R. M., & Owens, D. (2008). Racial microaggressions against Black counseling and counseling psychology faculty: A central challenge in the multicultural counseling movement. *Journal of Counseling and Development, 86*(3)*, 348-355. doi: 10.1002/j.1556-6678.2008.tb00519.x

Constantine, M. G., & Sue, D. W. (2007). Perceptions of racial microaggressions among Black supervisees in cross-racial dyads. *Journal of Counseling Psychology, 54*, 142-153. doi: 10.1037/0022-0167.54.2.142

Council for Accreditation of Counseling and Related Educational Programs. (2009). *CACREP 2009 standards*. Alexandria, VA: Author.

D'Andrea, M., & Heckman, E. F. (2008). Contributing to the ongoing evolution of the multicultural counseling movement: An introduction to the special issue. *Journal of Counseling and Development, 86,* 259-260. doi: 10.1002/j.1556-6678.2008.tb00507.x

Helms, J. E. (1982). *Differential evaluations of minority and majority counseling trainees' practicum experiences.* Unpublished manuscript, University of Maryland, College Park.

Helms, J. E., & Carter, R. T. (1999). Relationship of White and Black racial identity attitudes and demographic similarity to counselor preference. *Journal of Counseling Psychology, 38,* 446-457. doi:10.1037/0022-0167.38.4.446

Helms, J. E., & Cook, D. A. (1999). *Using race and culture in counseling and psychotherapy: Theory and process.* Needham Heights, MA: Allyn & Bacon.

Nadal, K. L. (2011). The Racial and Ethnic Microaggressions Scale (REMS): Construction, reliability, and validity. *Journal of Counseling Psychology, 58*, 470-480. doi: 10.1037/a0025193

Parham, T. A., White, J. L., & Ajamu, A. (1999). *The psychology of Blacks: An African centered perspective* (3rd ed.)*. Upper Saddle River, NJ: Prentice Hall.

Phinney, J. S. (1992). The Multigroup Ethnic Identity Measure: A new scale for use with diverse groups. *Journal of Social Psychology, 136,* 156-176. doi: 10.1177/074355489272003

Sangganjanavanich, V. F. (2008). *The development and validation of the multicultural supervision scale* (Unpublished doctoral dissertation). University of North Colorado, Greeley, CO.

Wickman (1999). "Making something of it": An analysis of the conversation and language of Carl Rogers and Gloria. (Unpublished doctoral dissertation). Southern Illinois University Carbondale.

Wickman, S. A., & Campbell, C. (2003). An analysis of how Carl Rogers enacted client-centered conversation with Gloria. *Journal of Counseling and Development, 81,* 178-184.